Monitoring Report II: Treatment of Stakeholders

This Monitoring Report was approved by the AIR Board of Directors on September 16, 2024. The entire report is for internal use only. Do not duplicate or distribute without the express written approval of the Association for Institutional Research. Copyright 2024.

I certify that the information contained in this report is true.

Christine M Keller, Executive Director & CEO — August 27, 2024 (Date)

The information and data contained in this report covers the period of August 2023 to July 2024 unless otherwise noted. Stakeholders encompass all the individuals who interact with AIR and access its information, products, or services. Members are a subgroup of stakeholders with special rights, privileges, and/or benefits (EL II, Policies H & I).

Global Policy Language

With respect to interactions with stakeholders, the Executive Director will not cause or allow conditions, procedures, or decisions that are unsafe, undignified, or unnecessarily intrusive.

Interpretation 1

AIR will establish and communicate expectations for professional behavior and mutual respect to provide safe and dignified conditions for association activities, events, and communications for all participants. The expectations will include the consequences of violations as appropriate.

Evidence 1

- AIR follows the American Society of Association Executives (ASAE) recommendations for creating enforceable conduct guidelines for events and online communities- reserving the right to remove any violators/violations as part of association best practices to avoid legal liability, and to better ensure positive experiences for stakeholders.
    - By registering for an AIR sponsored event, all registrants agree to the Event Terms and Conditions, which include AIR's code of conduct and how to report unacceptable behavior. No violations were reported to AIR staff during the reporting period.
    - Given its prominence as a large, in-person event, agreement to a specific set of Terms and Conditions is included as a required part of the registration process for the AIR Forum. No violations were reported to AIR staff in 2024.
    - To participate in the AIR Hub online community, users must agree to the Community Participation Guidelines, and a streamlined and timely process has been developed for flagging and removing posts that are not in compliance with the guidelines. Additional measures of protection were implemented in summer of 2021, including fully moderated posts from first-time contributors to ensure the content in the community is relevant and to prevent SPAM.

- An example of AIR's efforts to provide stakeholders with safe and dignified experiences and activities is encapsulated within AIR's Statement on Racial Injustice, which commits the association to "*ensuring safe experiences for our community"* and *"encourage[s] and support the honest and respectful exchange of ideas and perspectives.*"

Interpretation 2
The interpretations and evidence for Policies A to I reasonably demonstrate that stakeholders (including members) are not subjected to conditions, procedures, or decisions that are unsafe, undignified, or unnecessarily intrusive.

Evidence 2
Evidence is provided within Policies A to I later in this report.

A. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Elicit information for which there is no clear necessity.

Interpretation 1
AIR will publicly disclose what information is requested from stakeholders, how it is used, and the privacy/security protections in place.

Evidence 1
The AIR privacy policy outlines protocols for the data requested, its use, and how/when it may be shared. The privacy policy is currently undergoing a thorough review and will be finalized and posted by the end of September 2024. At that time, the AIR user community will be appropriately notified.

Interpretation 2
AIR will have guidelines for information requests sent to stakeholders, including the use of targeted selection criteria, frequency of inquiries, and the potential value of the information collected for association operations, stakeholders, and the field.

Evidence 2
The established practice of carefully monitoring the number of information requests sent to individuals helps to strike an appropriate balance among the legitimate need to collect information for the benefit of the association, stakeholders, and the field with an awareness of the limited time and resources of AIR stakeholders.

AIR strives to limit the number of research surveys sent to an individual to no more than four per year, except under special circumstances. No stakeholders received more than four requests during the reporting period.

B. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Use methods of collecting, reviewing, transmitting, or storing stakeholder information that fails to protect against improper access to the material elicited.

Interpretation 1

a) AIR will maintain and use a bank-operated direct processing service for payments sent by mail.

b) There will be no lapse of certificates assuring that AIR servers use HTTPS security for electronic processing of financial transactions.

c) AIR will utilize tokenization for all credit card transactions, limiting the use and local storage of actual credit card information.

d) AIR staff involved with collecting payments will be trained on the prohibition of electronically saving, storing, or emailing social security or credit card numbers.

Evidence 1

a) AIR had a bank-operated post office box dedicated to payments throughout the reporting period with no gaps.

b) No incidents of expired security certificates that protect servers performing financial transactions were reported.

c) AIR used tokenization for electronic processing of card information with 3rd party payment processors without any gaps. AIR handles stakeholders' credit card information during the purchasing process through the e-commerce system. (Credit card information is not taken over the phone or by email.)

d) The process for handling credit card information is documented, reviewed at least annually, and distributed to applicable staff. The sensitive information policy was reviewed with staff in January 2024.

Note: Social security numbers are only collected from individuals who receive payments for services rendered to AIR. A typical stakeholder does not receive payment from AIR that requires completing W-9 or similar documents unless the stakeholder is also an AIR contractor. The protection of contractors' personal information, including social security numbers, is monitored under policy EL II - Treatment of Staff.

Interpretation 2

Directory information will be appropriately protected and stored using technological tools and established organization protocols, including the following:

a) Member directory lists will not be publicly available on the AIR website; access requires a login and password, in conjunction with an active membership. Individual members, who are not organizational membership administrators, may opt out of participating in the directory.

b) Member directory lists will not be sold or provided by AIR to commercial entities.

Evidence 2

a) No breaches of stakeholder information (including member directory information) occurred during the reporting period and no reports of stakeholder data being used inappropriately were made.

b) No directory information was sold or provided to a commercial entity.

C. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Fail to provide access to information, products, or services through appropriate accommodations for stakeholders with disabilities.

Interpretation 1

AIR's educational content will provide alternative access options for stakeholders with disabilities.

Evidence 1

AIR's educational content meets basic levels of accessibility, and AIR staff offer alternative options as requested or needed. In addition, the development and production of new content are attentive to more sophisticated tools and proactive approaches to accessibility for a wider array of stakeholders.

For example, closed captioning is enabled as a standard practice for virtual training, including IPEDS workshops PDP workshops, the Data Literacy Institute (DLI) tutorials, Foundations workshops, and the LEADs virtual events. IPEDS tutorials are closed captioned, and ADA compliant transcripts are located on each tutorial webpage.

Interpretation 2

AIR will plan and deliver **in-person events** that meet ADA requirements. The registration process and follow-up emails for in-person events will include opportunities for attendees to voluntarily describe and request any accommodation for special needs covered by ADA.

Evidence 2

During the registration process for in-person events, attendees are asked to indicate if they require any accommodation so that AIR can plan accordingly. Each request is followed-up individually.

- 2024 AIR Forum. Five people checked the box for accommodations during the AIR Forum registration process. We reached out individually to each person to follow up. Appropriate actions were taken, or information shared, in consultation with the person requesting the accommodation.

  In addition, in 2024 AIR staff shared resources and best practices for creating and presenting accessible presentations with Forum presenters.

- 2023 LEADs Seminar. AIR staff worked with one participant to accommodate a request.

- Other In-person events. No accommodation requests were made for the 2024 Institute for IPEDS Educators, the 2024 NCES Data Institute, or the in-person IPEDS workshops during the reporting period.

Interpretation 3

AIR will plan and deliver **virtual training and events** that meet ADA requirements. Event webpages, registration processes, and/or follow-up communications will include opportunities for attendees to voluntarily describe and request accommodations for special needs covered by ADA.

Evidence 3

During the registration process for virtual events, attendees are asked to indicate if they require any accommodations so that AIR can plan accordingly. Each request is followed-up individually.

- No accommodation requests were made for most virtual events including the Foundations workshops, PDP workshops, IPEDS workshops, the Holistic online, or the Data Literacy Institute.
- A request was met for closed captioning was made for the LEADs virtual events in fall 2023. Closed captioning is now standard practice for LEADs virtual events and does not need to be requested.
- Closed captioning is routinely enabled for contract staff joining the (in-person) NCES Data Institute and IPEDS Institute for Educators virtually. An accommodation request was also met for an online IPEDS Keyholder course.

Interpretation 4

The AIR website will use the WCAG (Web Content Accessibility Guidelines) 2.0 as a benchmark for accessibility.

Evidence 4

The redesigned AIR website that launched in February 2019 was WCAG 2.0 compliant per AIR's contract with Americaneagle.com. Those standards continue to be the benchmark for website updates and maintenance.

D. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Allow stakeholders to be unaware of what may be expected and what may not be expected from services.

Interpretation

A clear understanding of expectations is important for stakeholders to make informed decisions about participation or purchase, including ready access to cancellation policies. The interpretation focuses on services in which AIR invests a significant amount of time or financial resources and includes high levels of interaction with stakeholders.

a) Education and training opportunities will have webpages that describe the content to be delivered as well as any costs, participation requirements, and/or timelines.

b) Forum sponsors will be provided with information outlining timelines, contacts, and the sponsorship benefits available for specific investments.

c) All activities that require fees will be noted on relevant webpages.

d) At least one webpage describing the benefits and costs of AIR membership will be available for current and prospective members.

e) Contact information for the executive director will be easily accessible for stakeholders who have unanswered questions or feedback.

Evidence

a) Webpages outline expectations for education and training opportunities including costs, participation requirements, timelines, and cancellation policies.

- *Landing page for all professional development and training*
  https://www.airweb.org/collaborate-learn/professional-development-training
- *IPEDS Training*
  https://www.airweb.org/collaborate-learn/ipeds-training
- *Course catalog*
  https://www.airweb.org/collaborate-learn/professional-development-training/courses-workshops
- *Cancellation policies*
  https://www.airweb.org/about-air/finance-and-operations/cancellation-policies
- *Event Terms and Conditions for all events*
  https://www.airweb.org/about-air/finance-and-operations/event-terms-and-conditions

b) Forum sponsor information and resources were emailed to all potential sponsors and were included on the 2024 Forum website.

c) Registration and fees are included on activity and product webpages as indicated in the pages listed in (a) above. Registration and fees information can also be found within individual promotional emails and/or as a part of registration and purchase processes.

d) The AIR membership pages were updated and substantially redesigned during the reporting period to include the organizational membership option and communicate the benefits of individual and organizational membership more effectively. https://www.airweb.org/membership/organizations and https://www.airweb.org/membership/individuals

e) Contact information for the executive director is found in multiple places on the AIR website and visible to all stakeholders, including https://www.airweb.org/about-air/who-we-are/staff and https://www.airweb.org/treatment-of-stakeholders.

E. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Leave stakeholders uninformed of this policy, or without a way to be heard for persons who believe they have not been accorded a reasonable interpretation of their protections under this policy.

Interpretation

A webpage describing the Treatment of Stakeholders Policy will be available from a link in the AIR website footer. The webpage will note that stakeholders should contact the executive director with any concerns regarding stakeholder treatment.

Evidence

- The AIR website footer links to the Treatment of Stakeholders Policy webpage, which includes contact information for the executive director. No inquiries regarding the policy were received by the Executive Director during the reporting period.
- The Treatment of Stakeholders policy was highlighted in and linked from the August 2024 issue of the eAIR newsletter that was distributed to 15,541 stakeholders.
- New in 2024 was the addition of information on the Treatment of Stakeholders policy as a footer in multiple promotional emails throughout August.

F. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Discriminate in opportunities, activities, or practices because of age, mental or physical disability, genetic information, ethnic or national origin, race, color, religion, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, transgender, marital status, pregnancy, veteran status, or any other protected classifications.

Interpretation 1

AIR will establish and communicate expectations for professional behavior and mutual respect to provide not only safe and dignified conditions for association activities and events (Global Policy), but also an inclusive environment that prompts full participation and welcomes diverse perspectives.

Evidence 1

Examples of AIR's efforts to provide stakeholders with welcoming and inclusive experiences are delineated below.

- AIR's Statement on Racial Injustice commits the association and its staff to "*providing a welcoming and inclusive environment for association events and activities and ensuring safe experiences for our community … we encourage and support the honest and respectful exchange of ideas and perspectives.*"
- Agreement to a Terms and Conditions, which includes expectations for contributing to a "welcoming and inclusive environment," is included as part of the registration process for the AIR Forum. No violations were reported to AIR staff in 2024.

- By registering for an AIR sponsored event, registrants agree to the Event Terms and Conditions, which include AIR's code of conduct and expectations for creating the conditions for a respectful exchange of ideas and perspectives. No violations were reported to AIR staff during the reporting period.
- Consistent with past practice, the 2024 AIR Forum in Denver opened with a land acknowledgement coupled with a contribution of $3,300 to the Denver Indian Center to support programming for the Indigenous communities in the Denver area. An additional $3,300 was donated to the Colorado Coalition for the Homeless to express our gratitude and support to our host communities. (The donation amount for each organization was based on $2 for each Forum attendee.)
- To participate in the AIR Hub online community, users must agree to the Community Participation Guidelines, and a process is in place for flagging and removing posts that are not in compliance with the guidelines. Posts from first-time contributors must be approved by moderators to ensure the content in the community meets the participation guidelines and to prevent SPAM.

Interpretation 2

AIR will prioritize diversity in professional backgrounds, institutional affiliations, personal characteristics, and perspectives when considering the composition of Executive Office advisory groups and the selection of instructors, educators, facilitators, and speakers for courses and events.

Evidence 2

AIR staff prioritizes the inclusion of a range of backgrounds, experiences, and perspectives within event programming and educational content. For example, Forum keynote speakers over the past eight years have represented a variety of backgrounds (race/ethnicity, gender, national origin), industries, roles, and perspectives. In addition, a scan of the volunteer members of Executive Office advisory groups in the March 2024 incidental report shows a range of institutional affiliations and types. As another example, IPEDS Educators are carefully selected for their expertise and to represent the different higher education sectors and background characteristics of those seeking training.

G. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Treat stakeholders in a manner that does not align with commonly accepted business practices.

Interpretation 1

Technology infrastructure will be updated and maintained in a manner that permits the AIR staff to follow common business practices and to provide high levels of customer service for members.

Evidence 1

- The association management system and website launched in February of 2019 continue to provide the backbone for reliable AIR business services and an upgraded user experience. AIR regularly invests in improving the experience of stakeholders. For example, the user profile continues to be refined and the workflows for purchasing membership, products, and events are regularly reviewed and updated

to improve the customer experience. During the reporting period, membership status and renewal options were updated to take the organizational membership type into account so that users logging into MyAIR can more clearly see their membership status and options.

- The "up time" for the systems and website are over 99% and only offline for annual system upgrades. Stability and consistency for AIR's systems are maintained through planned data center redundancy.
- 92% of those responding to the 2024 AIR Forum evaluation were satisfied with the online registration process. (6% were neutral and 1% dissatisfied.) The satisfaction rating is consistent with 2022 and 2023 results and an increase of 8% over the 2021 and 2020 responses to the same question.

Interpretation 2

AIR will measure how the association and its programs, services, and resources are perceived by its stakeholders. In addition to specific program evaluations, a comprehensive survey will be administered on a biennial basis to gain a better understanding of community needs. The survey will also gather feedback on how AIR is serving those needs.

Evidence 2

- AIR administered its second comprehensive survey of stakeholders in September of 2022, with over 540 responses. (The first survey was conducted in August of 2020 and the next survey is scheduled for early 2025.) The overall findings were positive.
    - 77% of respondents (members and nonmembers) found high value in AIR programs, resources, and services.
    - Of the respondents familiar with AIR services, 90% would recommend AIR to a colleague.
    - 94% of members indicated they were likely to renew their AIR membership.
- An area for growth is to devote additional consideration and resources toward expanding awareness of AIR products and services such as the Holistic Approach to IR course, the Leadership with Evidence, Analytics, and Data course, and the Postsecondary Data Partnership offerings – over two-thirds of respondents were not familiar with these professional development opportunities.

H. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: For those stakeholders who are members, cause or allow the inhibition of their participation, as appropriate, in Association functioning.

Interpretation 1

AIR will provide a variety of opportunities for member participation and engagement in association functioning.

Evidence 1

(The participant counts are included as evidence that participation is "not inhibited" rather than as indicators of "correct" or "ideal" levels of participation.)

- AIR Hub, the association online community platform, is open to all stakeholders, including members. Across all communities, there were 5,665 unique participants as of July 2024 – up 19% from May 2023. In

addition, the total number of discussion posts was 8,761 as compared to 6,841 discussion posts one year ago.

- Below are examples of the variety of opportunities for members to contribute to association work within the policy governance framework:
    - 42 members served on 2024 AIR Forum advisory groups.
    - 185 members served as proposal reviewers for the 2024 AIR Forum.
    - 64 members served as peer reviewers of submissions for awards, publications, scholarships, and other items.
    - 9 members served on the 2024 eAIR Editorial Committee.
    - IR/IE professionals from 7 institutions (along with their IT and business officer colleagues) provided guidance and feedback on the creation of the Change with Analytics Playbook, that will be publicly released near the first of September.
- Example opportunities for members to submit content include eAIR stories and features, Professional File articles, Forum proposals, and webinar proposals. This type of participation provides substantive ways for AIR members to contribute value to the association and the field.
    - 137 members served as the lead author for one or more proposals for the 2024 AIR Forum in Denver. And, 318 members presented during the 2024 AIR Forum in Denver, individually or as part of a group.[1]
    - Two Professional File volumes have been published since July of 2023. The Fall 2023 volume was a special issue on artificial intelligence edited by long-time members Henry Zheng and Karen Webber.
    - The eAIR Newsletter regularly includes a featured article, opinion piece, or tech tip submitted by a member of the AIR community.
    - Eleven members contributed to content development and delivery for AIR's Postsecondary Data Partnership (PDP) portfolio of training, including workshop and tutorial design and delivery.

Interpretation 2

The Executive Office's support of the nominations and elections process will result in an annual non-contested certification of the election by the Nominations and Elections Committee (NEC). (*The Board is ultimately responsible to ensure that the association has a fair nominations and elections process that aligns with the Constitution and Bylaws. The Board has delegated support for this process to the Executive Director.*)

[1] These numbers reflect only AIR member participation in AIR Forum proposals and presentations. An individual is not required to be a member to submit a proposal or present at the AIR Forum.

Evidence 2

- The election results were certified by the NEC on March 5, 2024. The voting statistics for the 2024-2025 elections are as follows.

2024-2024 Election Statistics	
Ballots Sent: Individual Members	2,405
Ballots Sent: Organizational Member Voting Delegates	8
Ballots Counted: Individual Members	356 (14.8% of ballots sent)
Ballots Counted: Organizational Member Voting Delegates	8 (representing 165 members)
Total Votes	**364**
Voting Period	*February 5, 2024 – March 1, 2024*

- In the 2023-24 Board and NEC elections, 373 (16.4%) individual members voted. 355 (16.3%) voted in the 2022-23 elections and 376 (17.9%) voted in the 2021-22 elections)

Interpretation 3

AIR members will receive multiple, targeted communications announcing AIR's call for volunteers, respecting members' communication preferences (i.e., opted-in to receive emails of this type).

Evidence 3

- A total of 373 volunteer submissions occurred between August 2023 and May 2024. Volunteer numbers are down by 18% from a year ago.
- The volunteer sign up was again opened during the AIR Forum to take advantage of the publicity and momentum generated by the annual conference.
- Five specific volunteer marketing messages were sent to AIR members between August and October of 2023 to encourage members to volunteer and to highlight volunteer opportunities.
- New members receive "onboarding" emails that include participation and volunteer opportunities.

Interpretation 4

AIR members will value committee and volunteer opportunities.

Evidence 4

Of the 541 respondents to the fall 2022 stakeholder survey, 295 were members. Of those member respondents,

- 57% were aware of AIR committee and volunteer opportunities.

- 88% of those who were aware of AIR committee and volunteer opportunities rated the opportunities as good, very good, or excellent.

The next stakeholder survey is scheduled for early 2025.

I. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: For those stakeholders who are members, cause them to be unaware of the membership categories, dues, voting privileges, and access to Association services.

Interpretation 1

Information on membership categories, costs, and benefits will be readily accessible on the AIR website as well as within the member join and renewals processes.

Evidence 1

- Membership categories and costs: https://www.airweb.org/about-air/membership/dues
- Member benefits: https://www.airweb.org/membership/benefits

Interpretation 2

AIR members will receive multiple, targeted communications regarding the AIR leadership nomination process and the subsequent elections, while respecting members' communication preferences (i.e., opted-in to receive emails of this type).

Evidence 2

- Five emails (total of 10,942 sends) were sent to opted-in members regarding *nominations opportunities*, yielding an average 41.8% open rate and 5.7% click-through rate.
- Four emails (total of 7,231 sends) were sent to opted-in members regarding *elections*, yielding an average 58.6% open rate and 33.6% click-through rate. (The click through rate of 33.6% skewed high due to the small segment of organizational member voting delegates that had a click through rate of 75%.)
- *The average open rate for nonprofit association email campaigns in 2023 is 38.18% and the average click-through rate is 2.71%, according to Higher Logic.*

Interpretation 3

AIR members will receive multiple, targeted communications regarding key AIR programming and benefits, while respecting members' communication preferences (i.e., opted-in to receive emails of this type).

Evidence 3

While not representing all AIR programming and benefits, the AIR Forum and member renewal campaign are highlighted below as example evidence of communication efforts to sustain and expand awareness.

- 53 emails tailored to specific audiences and interests (total of 161,617 sends) were sent to opted-in members and nonmembers regarding the 2024 AIR Forum, yielding an average 44.7% open rate and 15.2% click-through rate.
- The individual membership renewal campaign was automated in 2021 to include a set of six reminder emails sent to individual members scheduled to renew, beginning 60 days before the membership is scheduled to end. The automated campaign has a 49.1% open rate and an average click-through rate of 32.4%.
- *The average open rate for nonprofit association email campaigns in 2023 is 38.18% and the average click-through rate is 2.71%, according to Higher Logic.*