

Monitoring Report II: Treatment of Stakeholders

This Monitoring Report was approved by the AIR Board of Directors on 9/12/2022. The entire report is for internal use only. Do not duplicate or distribute without the express written approval of the Association for Institutional Research. Copyright 2022.

I certify that the information contained in this report is true.



Christine M Keller, Executive Director & CEO

August 25, 2022

Date

The information and data contained in this report covers the period of August 2021 to July 2022 unless otherwise noted. Stakeholders encompass all the individuals who interact with AIR and access its information, products, or services. Members are a subgroup of stakeholders with special rights, privileges, and/or benefits (EL II, Policies H & I).

Global Policy Language

With respect to interactions with stakeholders, the Executive Director will not cause or allow conditions, procedures, or decisions that are unsafe, undignified, or unnecessarily intrusive.

Interpretation 1

AIR will establish and communicate expectations for professional behavior and mutual respect to provide safe and dignified conditions for association activities, events, and communications for all participants. The expectations will include the consequences of violations as appropriate.

Evidence 1

- An important element of AIR's efforts to provide stakeholders with safe and dignified experiences and activities is AIR's [Statement on Racial Injustice](#), which commits the association to "ensuring safe experiences for our community" and "encourage[s] and support the honest and respectful exchange of ideas and perspectives."
- AIR follows the American Society of Association Executives (ASAE) recommendations for creating enforceable conduct guidelines for events and online communities- reserving the right to remove any violators/violations as part of association best practices to avoid legal liability, and to better ensure positive experiences for stakeholders.
 - Agreement to a [Terms and Conditions](#) was included as part of the registration process for the 2022 AIR Forum. No violations were reported to AIR staff.
 - To participate in the AIR Hub online community, users must agree to the [Community Participation Guidelines](#), and a streamlined and timely process has been developed for flagging and removing posts that are not in compliance with the guidelines. Additional measures of protection were implemented in summer of 2021, including fully moderated posts from first-time contributors to ensure the content in the community is relevant and to prevent SPAM.

- Considering the uncertainty and potential health risks associated with the coronavirus pandemic during the reporting period, AIR carefully monitored the national and local situation when planning and communicating about the 2022 AIR Forum in Phoenix. AIR followed the guidance of the CDC and kept Forum attendees updated on any changes through a [dedicated webpage](#) and email communications. Care and attention were given to the health and safety of attendees while attempting to avoid “unnecessary intrusion” into personal choices and health situations (e.g., AIR did not collect vaccine or other health information from attendees).

Interpretation 2

The interpretations and evidence for Policies A to I reasonably demonstrate that stakeholders (including members) are not subjected to conditions, procedures, or decisions that are unsafe, undignified, or unnecessarily intrusive.

Evidence 2

Evidence is provided within Policies A to I later in this report.

A. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Elicit information for which there is no clear necessity.

Interpretation 1

AIR will publicly disclose what information is requested from stakeholders, how it is used, and the privacy/security protections in place.

Evidence 1

The AIR [privacy policy](#) outlines protocols for the data requested, its use, and how/when it may be shared. The policy was last updated in August of 2022.

Interpretation 2

AIR will have guidelines for information requests sent to stakeholders, including the use of targeted selection criteria, frequency of inquiries, and the potential value of the information collected for association operations, stakeholders, and the field.

Evidence 2

The established practice of carefully monitoring the number of survey requests sent to individuals helps to strike an appropriate balance among the legitimate need to collect information for the benefit of the association, stakeholders, and the field with an awareness of the limited time and resources of AIR stakeholders.

AIR strives to limit the number of research surveys sent to an individual to no more than four per year, except under special circumstances. No stakeholders received more than four requests during the reporting period.

B. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Use methods of collecting, reviewing, transmitting, or storing stakeholder information that fails to protect against improper access to the material elicited.

Interpretation 1

- a) AIR will maintain and use a bank-operated direct processing service for orders and payments sent by mail.
- b) There will be no lapse of certificates assuring that AIR servers use HTTPS security for electronic processing of financial transactions.
- c) AIR will utilize tokenization for all credit card transactions, limiting the use and local storage of actual credit card information.
- d) AIR staff involved with collecting payments will be trained on the prohibition of electronically saving, storing, or emailing social security or credit card numbers.

Evidence 1

- a) AIR had a bank-operated post office box dedicated to mail orders and payments throughout the reporting period with no gaps.
- b) No incidents of expired security certificates that protect servers performing financial transactions were reported.
- c) AIR used tokenization for electronic storage of credit card information on AIR servers without any gaps. AIR handles stakeholders' credit card information during the purchasing process through the e-commerce system. (Credit card information is not taken over the phone or by email.)
- d) The process for handling credit card information is documented, reviewed at least annually, and distributed to applicable staff.

Note: Social security numbers are only collected from individuals who receive payments for services rendered to AIR. A typical stakeholder does not receive payment from AIR that requires completing W-9 or similar documents unless the stakeholder is also an AIR contractor. The protection of contractors' personal information, including social security numbers, is monitored under policy EL II - Treatment of Staff.

Interpretation 2

Directory information will be appropriately protected and stored using technological tools and established organization protocols, including the following:

- a) Member directory lists will not be publicly available on the AIR website; access requires a login and password, in conjunction with an active membership. Members may opt-out of participating in the directory.
- b) Member directory lists will not be sold or provided by AIR to commercial entities.

Evidence 2

- a) No breaches of stakeholder information occurred during the reporting period and no reports of stakeholder data being used inappropriately were made.
- b) No directory information was sold or provided to a commercial entity.

C. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Fail to provide access to information, products, or services through appropriate accommodations for stakeholders with disabilities.

Interpretation 1

AIR will plan and deliver in-person events that meet ADA requirements. The registration process and follow-up emails for in-person events will include opportunities for attendees to voluntarily describe and request accommodations for special needs covered by ADA.

Evidence 1

The AIR Forum in Phoenix was the only in-person event that was hosted by AIR during the reporting period. During the registration process, attendees are asked to indicate if they require any accommodations so that AIR can plan accordingly. Each request is followed-up individually. There were no advance requests for accommodations in 2022.

In addition, AIR is actively developing additional resources and best practices to be shared with Forum presenters in 2023 to ensure that presentations, resources, and delivery are ADA compliant. This is based on feedback from the 2022 AIR Forum evaluations, direct observations, and attendees.

Interpretation 2

AIR will plan and deliver virtual training and events that meet ADA requirements. Event webpages, registration processes, and/or follow-up communications will include opportunities for attendees to voluntarily describe and request accommodations for special needs covered by ADA.

Evidence 2

- One request for accommodation was received for a virtual IPEDS Workshop. The workshop was recorded and a third-party vendor transcription service was used to transcribe it so it could be shared with the attendee after-the-fact. One request for accommodation was received from NCES staff to activate Zoom Live Transcription service for both the June NCES Data Institute meeting and the July Institute for IPEDS Educators meeting.
- IPEDS Tutorials are closed captioned, and ADA compliant transcripts are located on each tutorial web page.

Interpretation 3

The AIR website will use the WCAG (Web Content Accessibility Guidelines) 2.0 as a benchmark for accessibility.

Evidence 3

The redesigned AIR website that launched in February 2019 was WCAG 2.0 compliant per AIR's contract with Americaneagle.com. Those standards continue to be the benchmark for website updates and maintenance.

Interpretation 4

AIR's educational content will provide alternative access options for stakeholders with disabilities.

Evidence 4

AIR's educational content meets basic levels of accessibility, and AIR staff offer alternative options as requested or needed. In addition, the development and production of new content are attentive to more sophisticated tools and proactive approaches to accessibility for a wider array of stakeholders.

D. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Allow stakeholders to be unaware of what may be expected and what may not be expected from services.

Interpretation

A clear understanding of expectations is important for stakeholders to make informed decisions about participation or purchase, including ready access to cancellation policies. The interpretation focuses on services in which AIR invests a significant amount of time or financial resources and includes high levels of interaction with stakeholders.

- a) Education and training opportunities will have webpages that describe the content to be delivered as well as any costs, participation requirements, and/or timelines.
- b) Forum sponsors will be provided with information outlining timelines, contacts, and the sponsorship benefits available for specific investments.
- c) All activities that require fees will be noted on relevant webpages.
- d) At least one webpage describing the benefits and costs of AIR membership will be available for current and prospective members.
- e) Contract information for the executive director will be easily accessible for stakeholders who have unanswered questions or feedback.

Evidence

- a) Webpages outline expectations for education and training opportunities including costs, participation requirements, timelines, and cancellation policies.

Landing page for all professional development and training

<https://www.airweb.org/collaborate-learn/professional-development-training>

IPEDS Training

<https://www.airweb.org/collaborate-learn/ipeds-training>

Course Catalog

<https://www.airweb.org/collaborate-learn/professional-development-training/courses-workshops>

- b) Forum sponsor information and resources were emailed to all potential sponsors and were included on the 2022 Forum website.
- c) Registration and fees are included on activity and product webpages as indicated in the pages listed in (a) above. Registration and fees information can also be found within individual promotional emails and/or as a part of registration and commerce processes.
- d) The AIR membership pages were updated and substantially redesigned in 2021 to communicate the benefits of membership more effectively. The join/renew page is easily accessible from the AIR homepage. <https://www.airweb.org/about-air/membership/join-renew>
- e) Contact information for the executive director is found in multiple places on the AIR website and visible to all stakeholders, including <https://www.airweb.org/about-air/who-we-are/staff> and <https://www.airweb.org/treatment-of-stakeholders>.

E. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Leave stakeholders uninformed of this policy, or without a way to be heard for persons who believe they have not been accorded a reasonable interpretation of their protections under this policy.

Interpretation

A webpage describing the Treatment of Stakeholders Policy will be available from a link in the AIR website footer. The webpage will note that stakeholders should contact the executive director with any concerns regarding stakeholder treatment.

Evidence

- The AIR website footer links to the [Treatment of Stakeholders Policy](#) webpage, which includes contact information for the executive director. No inquiries regarding the policy were received by the Executive Director during the reporting period.
- The Treatment of Stakeholders policy was highlighted in and linked from the August 2022 issue of the eAIR newsletter that was distributed to approximately 8,000 stakeholders.

F. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Discriminate in opportunities, activities, or practices because of age, mental or physical disability, genetic information, ethnic or national origin, race, color, religion, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, transgender, marital status, pregnancy, veteran status, or any other protected classifications.

Interpretation 1

AIR will establish and communicate expectations for professional behavior and mutual respect to provide not only safe and dignified conditions for association activities and events (Global Policy), but also an inclusive environment that prompts full participation and welcomes diverse perspectives.

Evidence 1

Foundational to AIR's efforts to provide stakeholders with welcoming and inclusive experiences is AIR's [Statement on Racial Injustice](#), which commits the association and its staff to "providing a welcoming and inclusive environment for association events and activities and ensuring safe experiences for our community ... we encourage and support the honest and respectful exchange of ideas and perspectives."

- Agreement to a [Terms and Conditions](#) was included as part of the registration process for the 2022 AIR Forum. No violations were reported to AIR staff.
- A special effort was made to highlight the perspectives and contributions of Indigenous peoples during the 2022 Forum in Phoenix, including an opening land acknowledge coupled with a contribution of over \$2,400 to the Phoenix Indian Center as a "land use fee." The closing speaker was also selected for her expertise in Indigenous data governance.
- To participate in the AIR Hub online community, users must agree to the [Community Participation Guidelines](#), and a streamlined and timely process has been developed for flagging and removing posts that are not in compliance with the guidelines. Additional measures of protection were implemented in summer of 2021, including fully moderated posts from first-time contributors to ensure the content in the community is meets the participation guidelines and to prevent SPAM.

Interpretation 2

AIR will prioritize diversity in professional backgrounds, institutional affiliations, personal characteristics, and perspectives when considering the composition of Executive Office advisory groups and the selection of instructors, educators, facilitators, and speakers for courses and events.

Evidence 2

AIR staff prioritizes the inclusion of a range of backgrounds, experiences, and perspectives within event programming and educational content. For example, Forum keynote speakers over the past six years have represented a variety of backgrounds (race/ethnicity, gender, national origin), industries, roles, and perspectives. In addition, a scan of the volunteer members of Executive Office advisory groups in the [March 2022 incidental report](#) shows a range of institutional affiliations and types. The IPEDS educators represent all higher education sectors and background characteristics.

G. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: Treat stakeholders in a manner that does not align with commonly accepted business practices.

Interpretation 1

Technology infrastructure will be updated and maintained in a manner that permits the AIR staff to follow common business practices and to provide high levels of customer service for members.

Evidence 1

- The association management system and website launched in February of 2019 continue to provide the backbone for reliable AIR business services and an upgraded user experience. AIR regularly invests in improving the experience of stakeholders. For example, in 2021, the workflows for registrations, applications, and other user submissions were evaluated and improved. In 2022, the user profile was redesigned and the workflow for purchasing membership was reworked and implemented in late July.
- The “up time” for the systems and website are stable and consistent through a redundancy of data centers.
- 94% of those responding to the 2022 AIR Forum evaluation were satisfied with the online registration process. (4% were neutral and 2% dissatisfied.) The satisfaction rating is an increase of 10% over the 2021 and 2020 responses to the same question.
- Two AIR staff received the “Pivot Pro Super Forum” award from Higher Logic for their work to use the AIR Hub online community to enhance the learning experience of those enrolled in the Holistic course. The award process was competitive and national in scope.

Interpretation 2

AIR will measure how the association and its programs, services, and resources are perceived by its stakeholders. In addition to specific evaluations, a comprehensive survey will be administered on a biennial basis to gain a better understanding of community needs. The survey will also gather feedback on how AIR is serving those needs.

Evidence 2

- AIR conducted a comprehensive survey of its stakeholders in August of 2020, with nearly 1,100 responses. The overall findings were positive with three-quarters of respondents indicating they found high value in AIR programs, resources, and services. AIR’s net promoter score (NPS) – a commonly used metric of customer loyalty – was 54%. [According to the creators of the NPS, Bain & Company](#), a score over 0 is good, above 20 is favorable, and above 50 is excellent. *The stakeholder survey is scheduled for its second administration in late September of 2022.*
- 88% of those responding to the 2022 AIR Forum evaluation were satisfied with service from AIR staff during the Forum. (10% were neutral and 2% dissatisfied.) The satisfaction rating is consistent with ratings for other in-person Forums in 2019 and 2018.

H. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: For those stakeholders who are members, cause or allow the inhibition of their participation, as appropriate, in Association functioning.

Interpretation 1

AIR will provide a variety of opportunities for member participation and engagement in association functioning.

Evidence 1

(The participant counts are included as evidence that participation is “not inhibited” rather than as indicators of “correct” or “ideal” levels of participation.)

- AIR Hub, the association online community platform, is open to all stakeholders, including members. Across all communities, there were 2,485 participants as of May 31, 2022 – up 120% from the same time last year. In addition, the total number of discussion posts was 4,504 as compared to 1,221 discussion posts one year ago.
- Below are examples of how members have a variety of opportunities to contribute to association work within the policy governance framework:
 - 40 members served on 2022 AIR Forum advisory groups.
 - 169 members served as proposal reviewers for the 2022 AIR Forum.
 - 21 people reviewed AIR Professional File submissions during the reporting period.
 - 15 members served on the 2021 eAIR Editorial Committee.
- Example opportunities for members to submit content include eAIR stories and features, Professional File articles, Forum proposals, and webinar proposals. This type of participation provides substantive ways for AIR members to contribute value to the association and the field.
 - 111 members submitted proposals for the 2022 AIR Forum in Phoenix.
 - 194 members presented during the 2022 AIR Forum in Phoenix.
 - Two [Professional File](#) volumes were produced since July of 2021, with 2 articles each.
 - The quarterly “call for webinar proposals” resulted in 29 submissions during the reporting period, with 19 accepted or under consideration.
 - Thirteen members served as advisors in developing the components of the new LEADs course (Leadership with Evidence, Analytics, and Data). Four of those advisors were directly involved in developing the curriculum and also delivered the content.

Interpretation 2

The Executive Office’s support of the nominations and elections process will result in an annual non-contested certification of the election by the Nominations and Elections Committee (NEC). *(The Board is ultimately responsible to ensure that the association has a fair nominations and elections process that aligns with the Constitution and Bylaws. The Board has delegated support for this process to the Executive Director.)*

Evidence 2

- 355 members out of 2,172 who received ballots (16.3%) voted in the 2022-23 Board and NEC elections. (As a comparison, 376 members out of 2,103 who received ballots - 17.9% - voted in the 2021-22 Board and NEC elections)
- The election results were certified by the NEC on March 8, 2022.

Interpretation 3

AIR members will receive multiple, targeted communications announcing AIR's call for volunteers, respecting members' communication preferences (i.e., opted-in to receive emails of this type).

Evidence 3

- A revamped call for volunteers was launched in August 2021 to better communicate the breadth and variety of engagement opportunities as well as to engage volunteers more regularly throughout the year. A total of 423 volunteer submissions occurred between August 2021 and August 2022.
- New members receive "onboarding" emails that include participation and volunteer opportunities.

Interpretation 4

AIR members will value committee and volunteer opportunities.

Evidence 4

Of the 1,100 respondents to the fall 2020 stakeholder survey, 588 were members. Of those member respondents,

- 63% were aware of AIR committee and volunteer opportunities. While this is a solid foundation of awareness, the revamped and expanded volunteer communications are designed to build increased awareness and potential participation.
- 90% of those who were aware of AIR committee and volunteer opportunities rated the opportunities as good, very good, or excellent.

The stakeholder survey is scheduled for its second administration in late September of 2022.

I. Policy Language

The Executive Director will not: For those stakeholders who are members, cause them to be unaware of the membership categories, dues, voting privileges, and access to Association services.

Interpretation 1

Information on membership categories, costs, and benefits will be readily accessible on the AIR website as well as within the member join and renewals processes.

Evidence 1

- Membership categories and costs: <https://www.airweb.org/about-air/membership/dues>

- Member benefits: <https://www.airweb.org/about-air/membership/join-renew>

Interpretation 2

AIR members will receive multiple, targeted communications regarding the AIR leadership nomination process and the subsequent elections, while respecting members' communication preferences (i.e., opted-in to receive emails of this type).

Evidence 2

- Six different emails (total of 8,055 sends) were sent to opted-in members regarding *nominations opportunities*, yielding an average 39.0% open rate and 6.8% click thru rate.
- Five emails (total of 10,955 sends) were sent to opted-in members regarding *elections*, yielding an average 43.0% open rate and 16.81% click thru rate.
- *The average open rate for nonprofit email campaigns in 2022 is 26.6% and the average click thru rate is 2.7%, according to [Campaign Monitor](#).*

Interpretation 3

AIR members will receive multiple, targeted communications regarding key AIR programming and benefits, while respecting members' communication preferences (i.e., opted-in to receive emails of this type).

Evidence 3

While not representing all AIR programming and benefits, the Forum and member renewal campaign are highlighted below as example evidence of communication efforts to sustain and expand awareness.

- Ninety emails tailored to specific audiences and interests (total of 142,540 sends) were sent to opted-in members and nonmembers regarding the 2022 AIR Forum, yielding an average 45.13% open rate and 13.1% click rate.
- The membership renewal campaign was automated in 2021 to include a set of six reminder emails sent to members scheduled to renew, beginning 60 days before an individual's membership is scheduled to end. The automated campaign has a 41.6% open rate and an average click thru rate of 30.3%.
- *The average open rate for nonprofit email campaigns in 2022 is 26.6% and the average click thru rate is 2.7%, according to [Campaign Monitor](#).*

Interpretation 4

Most AIR members will be familiar with a majority of AIR core programs, resources, and services.

Evidence 4

Of the 588 members who responded to the 2020 stakeholder survey more than 60% indicated they were aware of approximately two-thirds of the AIR programs, resources, or services listed (11 of 17 options), including the AIR Forum (in-person), the *AIR Statement of Ethical Principles*, studies/reports, IPEDS education and training, research publications, the job board, eAIR, the National Survey of IR Offices, on-demand education and training, live education and training events, and committee and volunteer opportunities. The programs, resources and services with lower awareness tended to newer programs introduced within the

previous 6 months before the survey such as AIR Hub, the *Statement on Racial Injustice*, AIR Forum Virtual, or partnerships with other associations.

The stakeholder survey is scheduled for its second administration in late September of 2022.